



ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 25 N 1683

Date: 2009-08-15

Replaces ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 25 N/A

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 25
INTERCONNECTION OF INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY EQUIPMENT
Secretariat: Germany (DIN)

DOC TYPE: Voting report

TITLE: Voting report on ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 25 N 1652: ISO/IEC PDTR 29107-1: Information technology - Taxonomy of specifications - Part 1: The taxonomy and methods

SOURCE: SC 25 Secretary

PROJECT: 25.05.01-01

STATUS: The NWIP was distributed with SC 25 N 1201 and JTC 1 N 8165 and approved as recorded in SC 25 N 1229.
With SC 25 resolution 19/26, see SC 25 N 1595, the document was split in two parts.
The document is handed to PTTT with the request to resolve them and to update the text ready for FCD vote.

ACTION ID: FYI

DUE DATE: n/a

REQUESTED ACTION: For information

MEDIUM: Def

DISTRIBUTION: ITTF, JTC 1 Secretariat
P-, L-, O-Members of SC 25

No of Pages: 4 (including cover)

Title

SC 25 N 1683 Voting report on SC 25 N: 1652

Vote on ISO/IEC PDTR 29107-1

**SUBSTANTIAL
SUPPORT**

Information technology — Taxonomy of specifications - Part 1: The taxonomy and methods

RESULT OF VOTING not counting abstentions as votes

P-Members voting: 14 in favour out 18 of = 77,78 % (requirement \geq 66,66%) of those who have voted

P- Members voting: 4 negative votes out of 18 = 22,22 % (requirement \leq 25%)

P-Members reacting: 18 out of 27 = 65,52 % (requirement \geq 50%)

Country	Member Body					Comments	
			Yes	No	abst.	given	#
Australia	SAI	P	1				
Austria	OVE	P	1				
Belgium	BEC-CEB	P		1		1	1
Canada	SCC	P			1		
China	CESI	P	1				
Czech Republic	CSNI	P	1				
Denmark	DS	P	1				
Finland	SFS	P			1		
France	AFNOR	P		1		1	1
Germany	DKE	S	1				
India	BIS	P					
Ireland	NSAI	P					
Israel	SII	P					
Italy	CEI	P	1			1	1
Japan	JISC	P	1				
Kazakhstan	KAZMEMST	P					
Korea	KATS	P	1			1	1
Lebanon	LIBNOR	P					
Mexico	DGN	P	1				
Netherlands	NEN	P	1				
New Zealand	SNZ	P					
Norway	NEK	P					
Poland	PKN	P	1				
Singapore	SPRING	P			1		
Spain	AENOR	P			1		
Sweden	SNC	P	1				
Switzerland	SNV	P					
United Kingdom	BSI	P					
USA	ANSI	P		1		1	9
Sum	obliged to vote	29	13	3	4	5	13
			81,25%	18,75%			
		O					

Comments on SC 25 N 1653: ISO/IEC PDTR 29107-1: Information technology - Taxonomy of specifications – Part 1: The taxonomy method

E: editorial, G: general, T: technical

Page	Line	Clause	E/G/T	ID	Comment	Proposed change	Resolution
			GE	BE-01	This document is more a specification and not a standard. Therefore the proposal is to vote negative on the document as proposed as a standard.		The approved new work item proposal proposed a standard.
			G	Fr01	The main reason is that the use of the term “intelligent home” leads to conclude that this is a subset of smarthouse. See the European Code of practice SmartHouse.		To avoid misunderstandings the term "intelligent home" is already defined for the purpose of this document. Probably also the term "SmartHouse" should be included. Check whether these terms should not go to ISO/IEC 29108 and the two documents linked.
			E	IT1	The term “intelligent home” is too generic in view of a systematic classification.	Change “Intelligent home” with “Smart house”, already used in Europe.	See France 01
5	81	2		Secretary	The links to ISO/IEC 29108 is missing	ISO/IEC 29108 should be updated to mark those definitions that are used for the taxonomy. As soon as this is achieved ISO/IEC 29108 shall be listed under normative references.	
5	82f	3		Secretary	Reference to ISO/IEC 29108 is missing	Start this clause with: “For the purpose of this international standard, the following definitions apply.	
7	157	5	T	K01	It is meaningless to specify the geographical target of the specification, because the target area of an International Standard is always worldwide.	Delete Dimension F, namely, from line 157 to 160.	While this dimension should be superfluous with international standards it is important for a more generic taxonomy.
8	181	A.1	T	US01	The statements are subjective as to the primary reason home systems have not progressed at a faster rate.	Replace the first paragraph of Section A.1 with the following text: The market for home systems is growing worldwide. Despite attempts nationally, regionally, and internationally to specify uniform networking standards, manufacturers have chosen a variety of communications methods. The key for market success is to specify standards that achieve <i>interoperability</i> among applications and products regardless of the underlying communications protocol.	Deletion of the word "thus" in the last sentence should be sufficient. Not only noting the slow progress of interoperability in SC 25 there are serious doubts whether the solution contained in the proposed text is achievable and helpful.

9	208	A.1	T	US02	The sentence has several typographical errors; even so, it subjectively assumes that increased competition results in a limited market with lower product volumes.	The sentence should be replaced with the following: JTC 1 recognises that there are "instances where multiple standards make the most sense to respond to market requirements and to the needs of our society." (JTC 1 Resolution 49 of 2008). Therefore, standards to achieve product interoperability, such as ISO/IEC 18012, and to interconnect communications networks, such as ISO/IEC 15045, are essential to foster growth of the home systems industry.	The JTC 1 resolutions starts with the words "JTC 1 notes the nature of standardisation is to attract innovative ideas from multiple sources, choose the best ones and quantify them in specifications that facility widespread use. Further consistent with ISO's and IEC's "one standard" principle (for example TMB's policy and principal statement on global relevance), there are times when one standard is all that is required"
9	213	A.1	T	US03	This is a proposed standard, not a proposed joint work to be tasked..	The intent of this report is to identify and classify the various specifications and standards for home systems.	The long-term intent is to support the declaration of a consistent set of standards. The means used to this effect to identify, classify and structure various standards and their by the text overlaps and gaps.
9	215	A.1	T	US04	It may be "essential for the work on a consistent set of International Standards" but that is not the place of taxonomy. There is no need to create a taxonomy document if there exists a consistent set of standards, which inherently self-defines its taxonomy.	Remove "and therefore is essential for the work on a consistent set of International Standards"	Proposed change and rational for the proposal don't fit together. For the purpose of the taxonomy she observation to US 03.
10	243	A.3.2	E	US05	There is no space character between "is" and "used"	Change "isused" to "is used"	
10	246	A.3.2	E	US06	Spelling error	Change "Dmension 6" to Dimension 6"	
11	269	A.3.3	E	US07	Typography error	Use bold type for "Access Network:"	
12	292	A.3.3	E	US08	Grammar and clarity	Change "category were the most standards exists" to "category where the greatest diversity of standards exists.	
13	300	A.4	T	US09	Need to update the references to standards and specifications.	Change CEBus to LonTalk and colour it grey. Also colour KNX and Echonet grey. Change IHA to "CHA".	Consistent with SC 25 resolutions use international standards numbers instead of names used for marketing. ISO/IEC 14908 (LonTalk) is for buildings and not for homes and therefore could only be included in this document if the title of the document is changed to include buildings.
14		Bibliography		Secretary	The document shall include a bibliography that provides the sources for all documents mentioned.		