



# ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 25 N 1680

Date: 2009-08-11

Replaces ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 25 N/A

**ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 25**  
**INTERCONNECTION OF INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY EQUIPMENT**  
**Secretariat: Germany (DIN)**

**DOC TYPE:** Voting report

**TITLE:** Voting report and collation of comments on SC 25 N 1651: 1st CD ISO/IEC 15045-2, 2<sup>nd</sup> attempt: IT - Home electronic system (HES) gateway – Part 2: Modularity and protocol

**SOURCE:** SC 25 Secretary

**PROJECT:** 25.01.03.03

**STATUS:** A first NWIP was distributed with JTC 1/SC 25 N 1021 and JTC 1 N 7676 and approved 2005. After three failed FCDs the project was terminated by time out.  
A new work item proposal was distributed with SC 25 N 1649 and JTC 1 N 9574. It was approved subject to confirmation by the SC 25 plenary at Beijing 2009-09-11 as recorded in SC 25 N 1678. In parallel to the new work item proposal CD was distributed with SC 25 N 1651. It did not receive substantial support as recorded in this document, since more than 25 % disapproved.

**ACTION ID:** FYI

**DUE DATE:** n/a

**REQUESTED:** For information.

**ACTION:** The comments are handed to SC 25/WG 1 with a request for development of a way forward that takes into account the comments received and that is in line with the project presently developed in IEC TC 100 and that avoids the second failure of this work.

**MEDIUM:** Def

**DISTRIBUTION:** ITTF, JTC 1 Secretariat  
P-, L-, O-Members of SC 25

**No of Pages:** 4 (including cover)

Title	<b>SC 25 N 1680 voting report on SC 25 N 1651</b>
-------	---

<b>Approval of text of SC 25 N 1651: 1st CD ISO/IEC 14045-2, 2nd attempt: IT - Home electronic system (HES) gateway – Part 2: Modularity and protocol</b>	<b>NO SUBSTANTIAL SUPPORT</b>
---	-------------------------------

**RESULT OF VOTING not counting abstentions as votes**

P-Members voting: 8 in favour out of 15 = 53,33 % (requirement  $\geq 66,66$  %) of those who have voted

P- Members voting: 7 negative votes out of 15 = 46,67 % (requirement  $\leq 25$ %)

P-Members reacting: 19 out of 29 = 65,52 % (requirement  $\geq 50$  %)

Country	Member	YES	NO	Abstention	Comments	
					Received	Number
<b>P-Members</b>						
Australia	SAI	1				
Austria	OVE	1				
Belgium	NBN		1		1	1
Canada	SCC		1		1	4
China	CESI					
Czech Republic	UNMZ	1				
Denmark	DS	1				
Finland	SFS			1		
France	UTE		1		1	1
Germany	DKE		1		1	3
India	BIS					
Ireland	NSAI					
Israel	SII					
Italy	CEI		1		1	1
Japan	JISC	1				
Kazakhstan	KAZMEMST					
Korea	KATS	1				
Lebanon	LIBNOR					
Mexico	DGN	1				
Netherlands	NEC			1		
New Zealand	SNZ					
Norway	NEK					
Poland	PKN					
Singapore	SPRING			1		
Spain	AENOR			1		
Sweden	SNC		1		1	1
Switzerland	CES		1		1	3
United Kingdom	BSI					
USA	ANSI	1				
<b>Sum</b>	<b>29</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>14</b>
<b>O Member</b>						
Greece				1		

**Comments on SC 25 N 1651: CD 15045-2: Home Electronic System (HES) Gateway – Part 2: Modularity and Protocol**

E: editorial, G: general, T: technical

Page	Line	Clause	E/G/T	ID	Comment	Proposed change	Secretary's observations
00		Entire document	T	Cdn 1	The Canadian comments to the preceding have not been taken care of.. Therefore we have to reject the entire proposal. This refusal is even amplified due to the fact that parallel work is going on in IEC TC100 TA9 and is substantially more advanced.		Very valid observation.
00			G	Cdn 4	This document is based on a previously distributed document. Comments made then have not been fully accommodated (see comment above).	WG1 shall revise the document before re-submitting again as a CD.	The failure of the first attempt to develop this document is closely related to the rejection of member bodies comments.
00			G	CH3 DE-02	This document is based on a previously distributed document. Comments made then have not been fully accomodated (see comment above).	WG1 shall revise the document before submitting a CD.	See Canada 4
00			G	BE-01	Belgium does not support NWIP described in JTC1/SC25 N1649. There are no new elements thus there is no need to make a new work without any probability of success. Moreover, there are other groups working on the subject. The proposal is to wait the outcome of this work.		New ideas and coordination with IEC TC 100 seem necessary to avoid a second failure of the project.
00			G	CH1 DE-03 Cdn 2	IEC TC100 TA9 is developing IEC 62514 "Guidelines for Multimedia Gateway in Home Networks".  IEC 62514 and ISO/IEC 15045-2 shall not list contradicting requirements, leading to market confusion.	Coordinate requirements listed in this document with requirements in IEC 62514 developed by IEC TC100 TA9.	Coordination with the project in IEC TC 100 is essential.
00			G	SE1	Similar project already started in IEC TC100	Support the project in IEC TC 100 TA9 (IEC 62514)	TC Switzerland 1

Page	Line	Clause	E/G/T	ID	Comment	Proposed change	Secretary's observations
00			G	Fr01	(Same as 25N1649) The added value of this document is not obvious. It contains only generalities that moreover do not reflect the state of the art. Working on this project would be cost-un-efficient. In case the project would be added in the program of work, it should be a TR, not an IS.		See Belgium 1
00			G	IT1	The Italian national committee doesn't support this document considering that the proposed HG model is not representative of the present state of the art.		See Belgium 1
24	682 - 685	7.2.3	T	CH2 DE-01 Cdn 3	<p>“7.Configurable to allow trade-offs between reliability and time-sensitivity application requirements [...]“</p> <p>This is a very general statement that does not give any guidance on how reliability is measured and which measurable targets have to be reached.</p>	<p>Define how to measure reliability.</p> <p>Provide target values for reliability and time-sensitivity based on use cases (e.g. temperature control).</p>	In comparison with the CD 15045-2 the CDV 62514 is more mature and specification like and contains significantly more practical information.