



ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 25 N 1378

Date: 2007-08-09

Replaces ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 25 N/A

ISO/IEC JTC 1/SC 25
INTERCONNECTION OF INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY EQUIPMENT
Secretariat: Germany (DIN)

DOC TYPE: Voting report

TITLE: Voting report and collation of comments on SC 25 N 1328: ISO/IEC CD 14762: Information technology - Home and Building Electronic Systems (HBES) - Guidelines for functional safety

SOURCE: SC 25 Secretary

PROJECT: 25.01.06.03

STATUS: The NWIP has been distributed with the SC 25 N 1327 & JTC 1 N 8593. The work has been approved as recorded in SC 25 N 1377. The CD was distributed with SC 25 N 1328 and found substantial support as recorded in this document. The editor is requested to propose resolutions to the comments received in dialog with the appropriate partners in IEC SC 65A and with input from SC 25/WG 1 and to update the text accordingly. The FCD shall be distributed for vote in parallel with IEC SC 65A.

DUE DATE: n/a

REQUESTED: For information to the Members of SC 25 and to

ACTION IEC SC 65 Secretary.

MEDIUM: Def

DISTRIBUTION: ITTF, JTC 1 Secretariat
P-, L-, O-Members of SC 25, IEC SC 65A Secretary.

No of Pages: 3 (including cover)

SC 25 N 1378: voting report on SC 25 N 1328: SO/IEC CD 14762: Information technology - Home and Building Electronic Systems (HBES) - Guidelines for functional safety

Approval of text of ISO/IEC PDAM 11801

SUBSTANTIAL SUPPORT

RESULT OF VOTING not counting abstentions as votes (equation without 15lg(f/100))

P-Members voting: 13 in favour out of 16 of = 81,25 % (requirement $\geq 66,66\%$) of those who have voted

P- Members voting: 3 negative votes out of 16 = 18,75 % (requirement $\leq 25\%$)

P-Members voting: 16 out of 25 = 64,0% (requirement $\geq 50\%$)

Country	Member	Participation	Voted	Comments
Australia	SAI	P	NO	comments
Belgium	BEC-CEB	P	YES	
Canada	SCC			
China	CESI	P	YES	
Czech Republic	CSNI	P	YES	
Denmark	DS	P	YES	comments
Finland	SESKO	P		
France	AFNOR	P	YES	comments
Germany	DKE	S	YES	
Ireland	NSAI	P	Abstention	
India	BIS	P		
Israel	SII	P		
Italy	UNI	P	YES	
Japan	JISC	P	NO	comments
Kazakhstan	KAZMEMST	P		
Korea, Republic of	KATS	P	YES	
Mexico	DGN	P	YES	
Netherlands	NEN	P	YES	
New Zealand	SNZ	P		
Norway	NEK	P	YES	
Poland	PKN	P	YES	
Singapore	SPRING	P	Abstention	
Spain	AENOR	P	Late abstention	
Sweden	SNC	P	YES	
Switzerland	SNV	P	Late abstention	
United Kingdom	BSI	P		
USA	ANSI	P	NO	comments
P-Members	27			
		Approvals	13	Abst.: 2+2
		Disapproval	3	Not voting: 9-2

Collation of comments on SC 25 N 1328: ISO/IEC CD 14762: Information technology - Home and Building Electronic Systems (HBES) - Guidelines for functional safety

E: editorial, G: general, T: technical

Page	E/G/T	ID	Comment	Proposed change	Secretary's observations
00	G	DK 1	The Danish National Committee support the revision of ISO/IEC TR 14762. However, we strongly recommend to change the title and contents of the document to NOT use the expression 'Functional Safety' for the following reason		Note
00	T	DK 2	The definition of functional safety in this context is wrong due to the fact that the horizontal standard IEC 61508 clearly defines it to be used in conjunction with safety related systems only. Using the term 'functional safety' to describe the ability of carrying out a usual control function instead of keeping it related to a safety function will lead to confusion, and in particular this is dangerous in a safety perspective, even though it is related to avoiding hazards. However, the idea of building control systems based on the principles laid down in IEC 61508 is good. In English 'safety', 'security', 'certainty' cover different concepts, whereas in other languages only one expression covers these concepts. The draft is intended to setup requirements for the certainty of functions to be carried so that no hazard occurs.	The Danish National Committee propose to use the expression 'functional certainty' for such functions, hence urging JTC1/SC 25 to change title and contents accordingly.	Accept in principle: avoid to the terms "functional safety" and replace with a better term to be developed in dialog with IEC SC 65A.
00	G	DK 3	We strongly recommend that the revision is done in co-operation with IEC/SC65A.		Accept
00		AU	DUE TO 'NO' VOTE TO NWI		Note
	G	Fr01	FRNC considers this document as a good proposal that should lead to very few comments.		Note
00	G	Fr02	This document refers to a lot of ENs that have IS equivalent. Please check normative references and bibliography and replace as far as possible ENs with relevant IS.		Accept
2, 3, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 21, 22, 23, 26, 27, 30		J01	All description of "HBES" should be changed to "HES".		Reject: the specification outlined in ISO/IEC 14762 also apply to buildings that do not contain homes. See also DK 2.
10	T,G	J02	230V/400VA should be deleted.		Accept
00	G	US-1	The document should be developed with reference the considerable effort invested by WG1 previously on the subject of safety. The document has not been vetted by the national-body experts for CD status.	The national body proposing the text should be identified and should send experts to WG1 to develop a working draft.	Note and welcome more specific changes during FCD vote.